

Independent Accountability Panel's 2018 Report on Private Sector Accountability MSD for Mothers Submission

MSD for Mothers is pleased to submit five examples of private sector accountability for women's, children's and adolescents' health for the IAP to consider including in its 2018 report on Private Sector Accountability. These examples are summarized below and supporting background materials (including relevant publications) are hyperlinked.

The five models are organized according to the three priority categories identified by IAP:

1. Private sector roles and accountabilities in health systems strengthening, UHC, and privatization of healthcare with a focus on women's, children's and adolescents' health
2. Effective private sector accountability processes and mechanisms
3. Private sector resource flows for women's, children's and adolescents' health

Background

[MSD for Mothers](#) is MSD's 10-year, \$500 million global initiative to create a world where no woman dies giving life. We are working to provide women with access to two of the most powerful means to end preventable maternal deaths: quality maternity care and modern contraception.

We integrate the invention and expertise of the private sector – from multinational companies to local private health providers and entrepreneurs – to 1) empower women to get the quality care they need, 2) equip health providers to provide high-quality care, and 3) strengthen health systems to sustain the delivery of those services.

Submissions

Private sector roles and accountabilities in health systems strengthening, UHC, and privatization of healthcare with a focus on women's, children's and adolescents' health

1. The Informed Push Model | integrating the private sector to strengthen public health supply chains

This supply chain innovation reduced contraceptive stock-outs from up to 80% in some places to less than 2% by integrating private logistics providers into Senegal's public health supply chain and holding them accountable for ensuring that contraceptive products are available in facilities when women want them. Contraception is recognized as one of the most cost-effective ways to lower maternal mortality rates – potentially averting one-third of maternal deaths by reducing the overall number of pregnancies and helping women plan and space their pregnancies.

Due to the dramatic impact of the program, the government of Senegal adopted this supply chain transformation and expanded it beyond contraceptives to include approximately 100 essential commodities related to HIV, malaria and tuberculosis.

What is it? Senegal's government and National Supply Pharmacy partnered with IntraHealth, MSD for Mothers, and the Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation to introduce the Informed Push Model ([IPM-3PL](#)). IPM-3PL integrates private sector suppliers into Senegal's public health supply chain and "pushes" a mix of products to health care facilities based on "informed" decisions about actual need determined by

data on these facilities' consumption patterns. To date, the program has reduced total contraceptive stock-outs to less than 2% nationwide in over 1,400 health facilities, improving access to family planning services for more than 3.2 million women.

How does the Informed Push Model strengthen private sector roles and accountabilities?

Private sector held accountable for health system strengthening

- The Informed Push Model with Third-Party Logistics Providers (IPM-3PL) demonstrates how the **private sector can contribute to strengthening national health systems and be held accountable for doing so**. An effective supply chain is an essential component of a functional health system. In the Informed Push Model, private logistics providers work under the management of the Senegalese government to provide women with reliable access to the modern contraceptive method of their choice. The government holds these private logistics providers accountable through a few different mechanisms:

Performance-based contracting

- The **public private partnership** involves the Senegalese government using **performance-based contracting to hold private logistics providers accountable** for meeting targets that make sure contraceptive products reach the last mile of the healthcare system.

Strong data to enable accountability

- The model relies on an **online logistics management information system** that monitors and reports stock-outs. Private logistics providers deliver commodities to health facilities, making real-time stocking decisions based on inventory and consumption data. 3PLs perform forecasting, logistics and data management on behalf of public facility staff.

Potential to replicate this accountability model to strengthen health systems

- *MSD for Mothers* is working with Village Reach to explore how to **replicate components of the model in Nigeria**, a country with low contraception uptake - only 10% among married women.
- The Global Financing Facility (GFF) included the IPM-3PL model as part of the Senegal reinvestment case.

Evidence

Evidence related to IPM is a mix of third-party evaluations, programmatic data and self-reported information.

Publications

- Cissé, C., Hasselback, L., Gueye, B., Ndour, S. K., & Ndao, O. (2015). Innovations in improving access to contraceptives. *Annals of Global Health*, 81(1), 73. [http://www.annalsofglobalhealth.org/article/S2214-9996\(15\)00678-5/pdf](http://www.annalsofglobalhealth.org/article/S2214-9996(15)00678-5/pdf)
- Daff, B.M., Seck, C., Belkhat, H., Sutton, P., Informed push distribution of contraceptives in Senegal reduces stock-outs and improves quality of family planning services. *Global Health Science and Practice*, 2(2), pp. 245-252. May 2014. <http://dx.doi.org/10.9745/GHSP-D-13-00171>.
- Daff BM, Seck C, Belkhat H, Sutton P. Le système de distribution en « Push » des contraceptifs mis en place au Sénégal réduit les ruptures de stock et améliore la qualité des services de planning familial. *Glob Health Sci Pact*. 2014 ;2(2):245-252. <http://dx.doi.org/10.9745/GHSP-D-13-00171>.

- Dicko, M., Souare, B., Sarr, LC., Gueye, B. (2017). When technical achievements aren't enough: Lessons learned from efforts to catalyze policy action on supply chain in Senegal. *Vaccines*, 35(17), pp. 2209-2213, 19 April 2017. <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/28364933>.
- Hasselback, L., Dicko, M., Viadro, C., Ndour, S., Ndao, O., Wesson, J. (2017). Understanding and addressing contraceptive stockouts to increase family planning access and uptake in Senegal. *BMC Health Services Research*, online, 26 May 2017. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12913-017-2316-y>.
- Hasselback, L., Gueye, B., Ndao, O., Ndour, S.K., Cissé, C. (2014). Incentivizing access to family planning in Senegal via the informed push model. *Journal of Pharmaceutical Policy and Practice*, 7(1), 012.17 December 2014. [10.1186/2052-3211-7-S1-012](https://doi.org/10.1186/2052-3211-7-S1-012),
- Agrawal P, Barton I, Bianco RD, Hovig D, Sarley D, Yadav P. Moving Medicine, Moving Minds: Helping Developing Countries Overcome Barriers to Outsourcing Health Commodity Distribution to Boost Supply Chain Performance and Strengthen Health Systems. *Glob Health Sci Pract*. 2016 Sep 29;4(3):359-65. <http://10.9745/GHSP-D-16-00130>.
- Cavallaro, F.L., Duclos, D., Baggaley, R.F., Penn-Kekana, L., Goodman, C., Vahanian, A., Santos, A.C., Bradley, J., Paintain, L., Gallien, J., Gasparrini, A., Hasselback, L., Lynch, C.A. (2016). Taking stock: protocol for evaluating a family planning supply chain intervention in Senegal. *Reproductive Health*, 13(45). 21 April 2016. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12978-016-0163-7>
- **Case study:** Better Business, Better World Case Study, Feb 2017. [Link](#).
- **Case Study:** Access to Medicine Index. Best and Innovative Practices. [Link](#).
- **MSD for Mothers Videos:** [Our Work | Senegal](#)
 - MSD for Mothers IPM video
 - Video featuring Senegal Minister of Health Dr Awa Coll-Seck
- [IPM-3PL Technical factsheet](#)
- [IPM-3PL Technical brief](#)
- **MSD for Mothers Announcement:** Partners Celebrate Transition of Informed Push Model to the Government of Senegal. [Link](#).
- **MSD for Mothers Blog:** Keeping All Options Open: How the private sector helped Senegal address its market challenges for family planning and bring back choice to women, [Link](#).

2. Manyata | Standardizing and assuring quality of care among private maternity providers in India

The Manyata initiative aims to improve and assure the quality of care offered by private maternity providers in India who serve up to 50% of women who seek maternity care. Women may prefer private care for many reasons, including proximity to their home, flexible hours, perceived quality, a sense of personalized care, and sensitivity to local needs, cultures and customs. However, private healthcare can be unregulated and of variable quality.

Manyata is a national certification and quality improvement system – endorsed by India’s national private maternity provider association - that helps providers improve adherence to quality standards. As more private providers apply for Manyata certification, its potential as a mechanism for holding the country’s private health sector accountable grows considerably.

What is it? In Manyata’s first phase, Jhpiego, the Federation of Obstetric and Gynecological Societies of India (FOGSI) and *MSD for Mothers* streamlined quality standards for private maternity providers and helped more than 140 providers, serving over 110,000 women, meet those standards. The partners also developed a practical toolkit – the Private Maternity Care Quality Toolkit ([PMC-QT](#)) – that includes

streamlined quality standards and measurement tools designed for any private maternity provider to use in low- and middle-income settings.

Today, [Manyata](#) is scaling this quality improvement model to help providers in Uttar Pradesh, Jharkhand and Maharashtra enhance their care and adhere to [FOGSI-endorsed quality standards](#). Providers who consistently deliver quality care to the women they serve will receive a FOGSI quality certification and could become eligible for national or international accreditation.

How does Manyata strengthen private sector accountabilities?

Manyata standardizes quality across the private health sector, using standards that align with those used in India's public health system

- Manyata is a **private maternity provider-led effort to standardize** quality of care so that women receive the best quality maternal health care.
- FOGSI endorsed a core set of quality standards, signaling that the private provider community in India is taking important steps to create a **national quality standard for maternity care** that aligns with WHO and national quality standards and holds private providers accountable for meeting those standards.

Manyata seeks to scale a quality improvement model that helps providers adhere to quality standards

- Through Manyata, providers participate in quality improvement activities to meet FOGSI-endorsed standards. The training **strengthens the local private sector's skills and capacities** to meet quality standards.

Manyata offers quality certification so that providers are held publicly accountable for meeting quality standards

- Once providers meet standards, they become eligible for the Manyata certification. By certifying providers who meet quality standards, Manyata creates **an incentive for private providers to offer quality care**. The certification helps them distinguish themselves from their competition.

Potential to make this accountability mechanism scalable and sustainable

- Today, this quality improvement model is available in three states in India with plans to expand to two more. The vision is that Manyata will offer a **means for standardizing and assuring quality maternity care nation-wide**.
- Manyata also serves as an entry-point for private providers to seek **national accreditation** for safety and quality.
- Looking ahead, Manyata certification could be used as a way for **payors to selectively empanel certified providers for reimbursement, helping ensure sustainability**.

Evidence

Evidence related to Manyata is self-reported through program partners and participating private maternity providers.

- [Manyata program fact sheet](#)
- [Manyata phase I white paper](#)
- [Short film](#)

- Indian media coverage on Manyata
 - <https://khabar.ndtv.com/video/show/news/manyata-movement-for-pregnant-women-launched-in-mumbai-472713>
 - <http://indiatoday.intoday.in/story/shilpa-shetty-federation-of-obstetric-and-gynaecological-societies-of-india-mortality-rate-child-birth-lifest/1/1092656.html>
 - http://www.business-standard.com/article/news-ani/fogsi-launches-manyata-a-nationwide-movement-for-quality-maternal-care-in-india-117112000872_1.html
 - <https://www.outlookindia.com/newscroll/fogsi-launches-manyata--a-nationwide-movement-for-quality-maternal-care-in-india/1192473>
 - <https://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/city/bengaluru/initiative-launched-for-standardizing-quality-maternal-care/articleshow/61780077.cmshttp://indiatoday.intoday.in/story/shilpa-shetty-federation-of-obstetric-and-gynaecological-societies-of-india-mortality-rate-child-birth-lifest/1/1092656.html>
 - <https://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/city/bengaluru/initiative-launched-for-standardizing-quality-maternal-care/articleshow/61780077.cms>

- Manyata leadership editorials
 - <https://health.economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/industry/improving-quality-of-care-is-the-most-powerful-means-to-end-preventable-maternal-deaths-pompy-sridhar/62022266>
 - <https://health.economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/industry/need-to-improve-maternal-care-services-in-small-private-facilities-to-combat-maternal-mortality-in-india/61501902>

Effective private sector accountability processes and mechanisms

3. Together for Her Health | A social accountability platform for private maternity care in India

Together for Her Health is a web-based platform that has over 17,000 patient reviews of the quality of maternity care experienced during labor and delivery and immediate postpartum. Comments help women choose where to deliver. By channeling patient reviews back to providers, the platform helps hold them accountable for delivering quality maternity care.

What is it? [Together for Her Health](#) is a web-based platform designed by Almata, in partnership with *MSD for Mothers*, that educates women on quality maternity care and allows them to rate the care they receive. Private providers receive their patients' ratings – which are also posted publicly – holding them accountable for delivering respectful, quality care. The online community displays patients' reviews of providers to help others make more confident decisions about their choice of maternity hospital. The platform has over 17,000 reviews and over 600 facilities signed up - and continues to grow. Ratings are made based on WHO-aligned quality of care indicators developed using principles of user-centered design. The platform currently includes facilities in the Indian states of Maharashtra and the National Capital Region.

How does Together for Her Health strengthen private sector accountabilities?

Together for Her Health empowers women to recognize and rate quality

- This promising **social accountability platform** offers a mechanism for **patients to offer feedback directly to private providers** on the quality of maternity care received during labor and delivery. Other women see their feedback and use it to make informed decisions about where to deliver.

- The platform responds to **women’s interest in expressing their preferences to private providers, helping hold them accountable for performance.** Over the last month alone, the platform received almost 1,000 reviews.
 - Private providers’ willingness to participate in Together for Her Health and publicly share client feedback is a promising indicator of increasing transparency in the private health sector.

Quality ratings are based on an evidence-based quality of care framework

- Women offer feedback on the quality of care received by responding to simple questions which are aligned with a unique quality of care **patient-friendly framework for tracking private providers’** quality of care. These questions were developed using a series of user-based testing.

Builds on past success in private provider accountability

- Together for Her Health builds on *MSD for Mothers’* previous investments in community accountability platforms for private maternity care. Its first iteration, Mobile Monitor for Quality of Maternal Care (MoM-QC) was a phone-based system that informed women in villages in Jharkhand about their entitlements for health care and then followed up to record women’s feedback on quality of care. This iteration of Together for Her Health has reached 11,000 women. These women’s awareness of healthcare entitlements increased by up to 67% and almost **all women demonstrated greater understanding of what quality of care should include.**

Evidence

Evidence related to Together for Her Health is self-reported through program partners, participating private providers, and users.

- Book Chapter: Empowering Women in India to Influence Maternal Healthcare Quality Through Mobile Phones and Crowdsourcing (Appears in [Global Perspectives on Women’s Sexual and Reproductive Health Across the Lifecourse](#))
- [MoM-QC white paper](#)
- [Together for Her Health fact sheet](#)
- [White Ribbon Alliance fact sheet](#)

4. Nivi | A social accountability platform for family planning in Kenya

[Nivi](#) is a mobile-phone based service used by over 2,500 women in Kenya to select a contraceptive method and seek care from a provider offering the preferred method. Women also offer feedback on the services they receive from both public and private providers to help hold them accountable for delivering quality care.

What is it? *MSD for Mothers* is supporting the pilot development of [Nivi](#) - a mobile-phone based service that uses interactive voice response and SMS to help women learn about their contraception options, identify the method(s) they want and find local public and private sector providers who offer quality services and have their preferred methods available. After going to the health facility, Nivi will call patients and ask them whether they were satisfied with the quality of care they received and whether they were able to obtain their chosen methods.

How does it demonstrate private sector accountabilities?

Nivi holds private and public-sector providers accountable for offering the contraceptive methods they claim to offer

- Nivi is a **social enterprise taking on social accountability** as part of a broader service delivery package.
- The platform leverages the accessibility of mobile phones to **hold providers accountable for offering the methods they advertise and doing so in a way that meets patient expectations.**

Nivi offers women a private, confidential platform to learn about contraceptive methods and to offer their feedback.

- By using mobile technology, Nivi offers a level of confidentiality that may be appreciated by **women and adolescents** – over 40% of Nivi's users are under the age of 24.
- Women rate the quality of care they experience during their interaction with healthcare service providers – **creating a market of informed consumers demanding quality care from their healthcare providers in the public and private sectors and holding them accountable for performance.**

Evidence

Evidence related to Nivi is self-reported through program partners, participating private providers, and users.

- [Nivi fact sheet](#)

Private sector resource flows for women's, children's and adolescents' health

5. The Utkrisht impact bond | Leveraging innovative public-private partnership models to improve the quality of maternity care delivered by Rajasthan's private providers

To meet the SDGs for maternal, newborn, and child health, we must close a \$33b funding gap. We need a transformation in how we approach financing, including innovative approaches for identifying new funding sources and making sure we invest as effectively and efficiently as possible. Development impact bonds (DIBs) are an innovative financing approach used to forge public private partnerships to achieve health and development outcomes. In a DIB, private investors offer risk capital for program implementation. Capital is repaid by outcome funders if pre-determined targets are achieved by service providers.

What is it? The Utkrisht impact bond is one of the largest DIBs to date and the world's first to improve maternal and newborn health. It aims to standardize quality among private maternity providers in Rajasthan – one of India's high need states. If successful, the Utkrisht impact bond will reach 400 providers and could save thousands of lives.

MSD for Mothers will be an outcome funder in the DIB, re-paying investors for the initial capital they provide to implementers once results are achieved. Through DIBs, risk of failure is shifted to investors, allowing governments and other donors to spend resources more effectively. Partners (USAID, UBS Optimus Foundation, Palladium) plan to be implementing the \$9 million, three-year initiative in April 2018.

How does it demonstrate private sector accountabilities?

The DIB model is a public private partnership model that introduces accountability for results

- This **public private partnership leverages private investment** to advance the health of women and newborns. Through DIBs, risk of failure is shifted to investors, allowing outcome funders, such as governments and other donors, to spend resources more effectively. As the outcome funder for the Utkrisht impact bond, *MSD for Mothers* will re-pay private investors for the initial capital they provide to implementers once results are achieved.

The Utkrisht impact bond aims to increase private provider accountability for offering quality care

- The Utkrisht impact bond defines success as **private provider adherence to quality standards**. By standardizing quality of care among Rajasthan's private providers, maternal health will improve. **Standardizing quality is a way to hold providers accountable for the quality of care they offer.**

Evidence

Evidence related to Utkrisht is self-reported. Two case studies developed by third parties on the Utkrisht development process will be released after the deadline for this submission.

- [Utkrisht impact bond brief](#)
- [Press release](#)
- [Brookings Institute announcement](#)